



ELSEVIER

Journal of Pure and Applied Algebra 135 (1999) 129–133

---

---

JOURNAL OF  
PURE AND  
APPLIED ALGEBRA

---

---

## About a question concerning $\mathbb{Q}$ -groups

Ion Armeanu\*

Mathematics Department, Physics Faculty, University of Bucharest, P.O. Box MG-11,  
Bucharest-Magurele, Romania

Communicated by A. Dold; received 14 February 1996; revised 9 June 1997

---

### Abstract

A  $\mathbb{Q}$ -group is a finite group all of whose ordinary complex representations have rationally valued characters. Let  $G$  be a solvable  $\mathbb{Q}$ -group so that the Schur index  $m_{\mathbb{R}}(\chi) = 1$  for all  $\chi \in \text{Irr}(G)$ . In [3, Note 1, p. 285] Gow asks if not, under these conditions, already  $m_{\mathbb{Q}}(\chi) = 1$  for all  $\chi \in \text{Irr}(G)$ . In this paper we shall prove that the answer of this question is positive. The notations and definitions will be those of [6]. © 1999 Elsevier Science B.V. All rights reserved.

1991 Math. Subj. Class.: 20C15

---

A  $\mathbb{Q}$ -group is a finite group all of whose ordinary complex representations have rationally valued characters. Let  $G$  be a solvable  $\mathbb{Q}$ -group so that the Schur index  $m_{\mathbb{R}}(\chi) = 1$  for all  $\chi \in \text{Irr}(G)$ . In [3, Note 1, p. 285] Gow asks if not, under these conditions, already  $m_{\mathbb{Q}}(\chi) = 1$  for all  $\chi \in \text{Irr}(G)$ . In this paper we shall prove that the answer of this question is positive. The notations and definitions will be those of [6].

The following theorem is a version of Brauer–Witt theorem, obtained from maximality arguments of a kind used by Benard in [1, Section 3].

**Theorem 1** (Benard [1], Gow [5]). *Let  $\chi$  be an irreducible character such that  $m_{\mathbb{R}}(\chi) = 1$  of the  $\mathbb{Q}$ -group  $G$ . There is a subgroup  $W$  of  $G$  and a real-valued irreducible character  $\varphi$  of  $W$  for which  $(\varphi, \chi_W)$  is odd and  $[\mathbb{Q}(\varphi) : \mathbb{Q}]$  is odd.  $W$  can be taken either to be a Sylow 2-subgroup of  $G$  or to have the form  $AH$ , where  $A$  is a cyclic subgroup of odd order generated by an element  $a$  and  $H$  is a Sylow*

---

\* E-mail: arme.scut.fizica.unibuc.ro.

2-subgroup of  $N_G(\langle a \rangle)$ . In the second case it can be assumed that  $A$  is not in the kernel of  $\varphi$ .

**Theorem 2** (Gow [3, Theorem 1, Note 1]). *Let  $G$  be a solvable  $\mathbb{Q}$ -group such that  $m_{\mathbb{R}}(\chi) = 1$  for all  $\chi \in \text{Irr}(G)$ . Then  $|G| = 2^a 3^b$ .*

**Theorem 3.** *Suppose  $G$  is a 2-group. If  $\chi \in \text{Irr}(G)$  is rational valued and has Schur index  $m_{\mathbb{R}}(\chi) = 1$ , then  $m_{\mathbb{Q}}(\chi) = 1$ .*

**Proof.** Since  $m_{\mathbb{Q}_p}(\chi) = 1$  for all prime numbers  $p \neq 2$  and  $m_{\mathbb{R}}(\chi) = 1$ , by Minkowski–Hasse theorem and using the Hilbert symbol, it follows that  $m_{\mathbb{Q}}(\chi) = 1$  (see [2]).  $\square$

**Main Theorem.** *Suppose  $G$  is a solvable  $\mathbb{Q}$ -group and  $m_{\mathbb{R}}(\chi) = 1$  for all  $\chi \in \text{Irr}(G)$ . Then  $m_{\mathbb{Q}}(\chi) = 1$  for all  $\chi \in \text{Irr}(G)$ .*

**Proof.** By Theorem 2 we have  $|G| = 2^c 3^b$ . If  $|G| = 2^c$  the statement follows by Theorem 3. Let  $\chi \in \text{Irr}(G)$  and  $\varphi, W, A, H, a$  be as in Theorem 1. Let  $K$  be a field such that  $\mathbb{Q}(\varphi) \subseteq K \subseteq \mathbb{Q}(\varepsilon)$ , for  $\varepsilon$  a primitive  $|G|$ th root of unity such that  $|\mathbb{Q}(\varepsilon) : K|$  is the 2-part of  $|\mathbb{Q}(\varepsilon) : \mathbb{Q}(\varphi)|$ . Let  $H_0 = C_H(a)$ .

**Remark 1.** By the choice of  $K$  and since  $|\mathbb{Q}(\varphi) : \mathbb{Q}|$  is odd,  $|K : \mathbb{Q}|$  is odd.

**Remark 2.** Since  $G$  is a  $\mathbb{Q}$ -group,  $N_G(A)/C_G(A) \simeq \text{Aut}(A)$ , hence a Sylow 2-subgroup of  $\text{Aut}(A)$  is isomorphic to  $H/H_0$ . Let  $\omega$  be a primitive  $|A|$ th root of unity. By the choice of  $K$ ,  $a^s, a^t$  are conjugate in  $H$  only if  $\omega^s, \omega^t$  are conjugate under the action of  $\text{Gal}(K(\varepsilon), K)$ . Hence  $W = AH$  is  $K$ -elementary with respect to 2.

*Case 1:*  $W$  is a Sylow 2-subgroup of  $G$ . Since  $\varphi$  is a character of a 2-group and  $|K : \mathbb{Q}|$  is odd by Remark 1,  $\varphi$  is  $\mathbb{Q}$ -valued.

Since  $(\varphi, \chi_W)$  is odd and  $m_{\mathbb{R}}(\chi) = 1$  by Brauer–Speiser theorem (which affirms that if  $\xi \in \text{Irr}(G)$  is real valued then  $m_{\mathbb{Q}}(\xi) \leq 2$ , see [6, p. 171]) it follows that  $m_{\mathbb{R}}(\varphi) = 1$ . Then, by Theorem 3,  $m_{\mathbb{Q}}(\varphi) = 1$ , so that  $m_{\mathbb{Q}}(\chi) = 1$ .

*Case 2:*  $W = AH$ , where  $A$  is nontrivial.

(a) If  $m_K(\varphi) = 1$  then  $m_{\mathbb{Q}}(\chi) = 1$ .

**Proof.** Since  $(\chi, \varphi^G)$  is odd, it follows that  $m_K(\chi) = 1$ . It follows from [6, Lemma 10.4, p. 162] for  $F = \mathbb{Q}$  that  $m_{\mathbb{Q}}(\chi)$  divides  $m_{\mathbb{Q}}(\varphi) |\mathbb{Q}(\varphi) : \mathbb{Q}| (\chi, \varphi^G)$ . Now,  $|\mathbb{Q}(\varphi) : \mathbb{Q}|$  divides  $|K : \mathbb{Q}|$ , which is odd. In view of the Brauer–Speiser theorem and the fact that  $|\mathbb{Q}(\varphi) : \mathbb{Q}| (\chi, \varphi^G)$  is odd, the previous relation implies that  $m_{\mathbb{Q}}(\chi)$  divides  $m_{\mathbb{Q}}(\varphi) = m_{\mathbb{Q}(\varphi)}(\varphi) = m_K(\varphi) = 1$  (see also [6, p. 161]).  $\square$

**Remark 3.** In the sequel we shall determine a splitting field for  $\varphi$ . Let  $X$  be a  $\mathbb{C}$ -representation of  $\varphi$ . By [6, Lemma 2.19, p. 23],  $g \in \ker(X)$  if and only if  $g \in \ker(\varphi)$ .

So, if  $Y$  is a  $\mathbb{C}$ -representation of  $\varphi/\ker(\varphi)$  then  $X(kg) = Y(g)$  is a  $\mathbb{C}$ -representation of  $\varphi$ . Hence,  $m_F(\varphi) = m_F(\varphi/\ker(\varphi))$  for any complex number field  $F$ . Also, in the sequel  $\chi$  appears only by  $\chi_W$  and the used properties of  $\varphi$  and  $\chi_W$  do not fail true factorization by  $\ker(\varphi)$ . Thus we can suppose that  $\varphi$  is faithful.

(b) By Remark 2 and Theorem 4.3 of [1] we have that:

- (1) there is  $\lambda \times \mu \in \text{Irr}(AH_0)$  such that  $(\lambda \times \mu)^{AH} = \varphi$ .
- (2)  $\mu$  is rational valued and is  $H$  invariant.
- (3)  $\lambda$  and  $\mu$  are faithful.

(c) Suppose that there is  $\tau \in \text{Irr}(H)$  an extension of  $\mu$ . If  $m_{\mathbb{Q}}(\tau) = 1$  then  $m_{\mathbb{Q}(\tau)}(\chi) = 1$  and if besides  $\mathbb{Q}(\tau) = \mathbb{Q}$  then  $m_{\mathbb{Q}}(\chi) = 1$ .

**Proof.** Let  $\tau$  be an extension of  $\mu$  to  $H$ . We have that  $m_{\mathbb{Q}(\tau)}(\varphi)$  divides  $m_{\mathbb{Q}(\tau)}(\tau) |\mathbb{Q}(\varphi, \tau) : \mathbb{Q}(\tau)| (\varphi, \tau^W)$  by [6, Lemma 10.4]. It follows from Mackey’s theorem that  $\varphi_H = \mu^H$ . Hence  $(\varphi, \tau^W) = (\varphi_H, \tau) = (\mu^H, \tau) = (\mu, \tau_{H_0}) = 1$ . Now suppose that  $m_{\mathbb{Q}(\tau)}(\tau) = m_{\mathbb{Q}}(\tau) = 1$ . Then since  $m_{\mathbb{Q}}(\chi)$  divides  $m_{\mathbb{Q}}(\varphi)$  and by the previous relation we have that  $m_{\mathbb{Q}(\tau)}(\chi)$  divides  $|\mathbb{Q}(\varphi, \tau)|$ . The latter number is odd by assumption, so the Brauer–Speiser theorem implies that  $m_{\mathbb{Q}(\tau)}(\chi) = 1$ .  $\square$

(d) There is an extension  $\tau$  of  $\mu$  to  $H$  and if  $m_{\mathbb{Q}}(\mu) = 1$  then  $m_{\mathbb{Q}}(\tau) = 1$ .

**Proof.** Since  $H/H_0$  is cyclic ( $|H/H_0| = 2$ , since  $|a| = 3^d$ ) by [6, Theorem 1.22, p. 186] it follows that there is an extension  $\tau$  of  $\mu$  to  $H$ . Since  $(\tau_{H_0}, \mu) = 1$  if  $\mathbb{Q}$  is a splitting field for  $\mu$  it follows that  $m_{\mathbb{Q}}(\tau) = 1$ .  $\square$

(e)  $m_{\mathbb{Q}}(\mu) = 1$  iff  $\tau$  is real valued.

**Proof.** Let  $1, t \in H$  be a transversal of  $H_0$  in  $H$  such that  $t^2 \in H_0$  and  $tat^{-1} = a^{-1}$ . Since  $\varphi$  is real valued and  $m_{\mathbb{R}}(\varphi) = 1$ , the Frobenius–Schur invariant  $v_2(\varphi) = v_2((\lambda \times \mu)^{AH}) = 1$ .

A direct computation shows that

$$v_2((\lambda \times \mu)^{AH}) = (1/|H_0|) \sum_{h \in H_0} \mu((ht)^2).$$

Then,

$$v_2(\tau) = (1/|H|) \sum_{x \in H} \tau(x^2) = (1/|H|) \sum \mu(x^2) = \left( 1/(2|H_0|) \left( \sum_{h \in H} \mu(h^2) + \mu((ht)^2) \right) \right).$$

Hence  $v_2(\tau)$  is 0 or 1.  $\square$

(f) To compute the Schur index of  $(\lambda \times \mu)^{AH}$  over the field  $K$ , we can assume that  $(\lambda \times \mu)^{AH}$  is  $K$ -primitive (i.e. is not induced from a  $K$ -valued character  $\nu$  of a proper subgroup  $AH'$  of  $AH$ ). Indeed, if there is a  $K$ -valued irreducible character  $\varphi_1$

of a proper subgroup  $W_1$  of  $W$  such that  $\varphi_1^W = \varphi$  then by the general properties of the Schur index  $m_K(\varphi) = m_K(\varphi_1)$ .

Then, applying Theorem 4.6 of [1] it follows that  $H'_0 = H_0 \cap H'$  is a dihedral or quaternion group of order 8, or  $|H'_0| \leq 2$ .

(g) If  $|H'_0| \leq 2$  then  $\mu$  is linear. If  $|H'_0| = 1$ , or  $H' \simeq \mathbb{Z}_2 \times \mathbb{Z}_2$  there is a rational-valued extension  $\tau$  of  $\mu$  such that  $m_{\mathbb{Q}}(\tau) = 1$  and the statement follows by (c).

If  $|H'_0| = 2$ , since  $v_2(\varphi) = 1$  and  $\mu$  is linear, an element of  $H' - H'_0$  which inverts  $a$  is an involution. Thus  $H' \simeq \mathbb{Z}_2 \times \mathbb{Z}_2$ .

(h) Let  $H_0$  be dihedral or quaternion group. Then  $|H| = 16$ . They are nine nonabelian groups of order 16.

(1)  $H = H_1 \times H_2$ , where  $H_1$  is the dihedral group of order 8 and  $|H_2| = 2$ . Then  $\tau$  is rationally valued and  $m_{\mathbb{Q}}(\tau) = 1$  and the statement follows by (c).

(2)  $H = H_1 \times H_2$ , where  $H_1$  is the quaternion group of order 8 and  $|H_2| = 2$ . Then  $v_2(\varphi) = -1$ . Thus this case is impossible.

(3)  $H$  is the generalized quaternion group. Then  $v_2(\varphi) = -1$ . Hence this case is impossible.

(4)  $H$  is the semidihedral group and  $H_0$  is dihedral. Then  $v_2(\varphi) = -1$ , impossible.

(5)  $H$  is semidihedral and  $H_0$  is quaternionic. Then  $\tau$  extends to a faithful character  $\tau$  of  $H$  with  $\mathbb{Q}(\tau) = \mathbb{Q}(i\sqrt{2})$  and  $m_{\mathbb{Q}}(\tau) = 1$ . Since  $\mathbb{Q}_3 = \mathbb{Q}_3(i\sqrt{2})$  it follows by (c) that  $m_{\mathbb{Q}_3}(\varphi) = 1$ . Since  $m_{\mathbb{Q}_{\infty}}(\varphi) = 1$ , by Hasse's theorem (see [2]) it follows that  $m_{\mathbb{Q}}(\varphi) = 1$ .

(6)  $H = \langle \{u, v, w \mid u^4 = v^2 = w^2 = 1, uv = vu, uw = wu, vvw = wu^2\} \rangle$  and  $H_0$  is dihedral. Then  $v_2(\varphi) = -1$ .

(7)  $H = H_0 \langle x \rangle$ , with  $H_0 = \langle u, v \rangle$  dihedral,  $u^4 = v^2 = 1, x^2 = u$  and  $x^{-1}vx = uv$ . Then  $v_2(\varphi) = -1$ .

(8)  $H = \langle \{u, v, w \mid u^4 = v^2 = w^2 = 1, uv = vu, uw = wu, vvw = wu^2\} \rangle$  and  $H_0$  is quaternionic or  $H$  is generalized dihedral and  $H_0$  is dihedral. In both cases  $m_{\mathbb{Q}}(\varphi) = 2$  but we shall prove using methods of [4], that these cases are impossible.

Let  $|A| = 2n + 1$  and  $\beta_1, \dots, \beta_n$  be the characters of the  $n$  nontrivial irreducible real representations of  $A$ . Then these characters can be extended to  $n$  characters  $\sigma_1, \dots, \sigma_n$  of real representations of  $W$ . To prove that, let  $\omega$  a primitive  $(2n + 1)$  root of unity. Then  $\beta_i(a^j) = \omega^{ij} + \omega^{-ij}$ . Take  $\alpha_i$  to be the complex linear character of  $A$  defined by  $\alpha_i(a^j) = \omega^{ij}$ . Each  $\alpha_i$  may be extended to an irreducible character  $\gamma_i$  of  $AH_0$  by putting  $\alpha_i(a^j h) = \alpha_i(a^j)$ , for every  $h$  in  $H_0$ . The  $n$  induced characters  $\sigma_i = \gamma_i^W$  are real-valued irreducible characters of  $W$  which extend the  $\beta_i$ . Now it is easy to show that  $\sigma_i$  are realizable in  $\mathbb{R}$  by computing the Frobenius–Schur invariant  $v_2(\sigma_i)$ .

Let  $\theta_i = \sigma_i^G$ . Clearly  $\theta_i$  are rational valued. Let  $\Phi$  be an irreducible constituent of  $\theta_i$ . Since  $m_{\mathbb{R}}(\Phi) = 1$ ,  $\Phi$  must occur with even multiplicity, hence  $\theta_i(a) \equiv 0 \pmod{2}$ .

Let  $D$  be the  $n \times n$  matrix with entries  $d_{ij} = \beta_j(a^i)$ .  $D$  is a  $n \times n$  submatrix of the real character table of  $A$ . Using the orthogonality relations we may show that  $(\det D)^2 = |A|^{n-1}$ .

Let  $\mathbb{Q}_{3^b}$  the field obtained by adjoining a primitive  $3^b$  root of unity to  $\mathbb{Q}$ . Let  $S$  be the ring of algebraic integers in  $\mathbb{Q}_{3^b}$  and let  $P$  be a maximal ideal of  $S$  containing 2.

Then there is a matrix  $E$  with entries in  $\mathbb{Q}_{3^b}$  such that  $DE = \alpha I$ , where  $\alpha \in \mathbb{Q}_{3^b}$ , and  $\alpha$  is not congruent to  $0 \pmod{P}$ . Set  $\rho = \sum_{i=1}^n e_i \theta_i$ , where  $e_1, \dots, e_n$  are the entries of the first column of  $E$ . From the definition of induced characters, we have

$$\rho(a) = (1/|W|) \sum_{x \in G} \sum_i e_i \theta_i(xax^{-1}),$$

where  $\theta_i(xax^{-1}) = 0$  if  $xax^{-1}$  is not in  $W$ . If  $xax^{-1} \in W$ , then  $xax^{-1} \in A$ , hence  $\theta_i(xax^{-1}) = \beta_i(a^j)$ . By the choice of  $e_1, \dots, e_n$ , the value of the inner sum in the above formula is 0 unless  $a^j = a$  or  $a^{-1}$ . It follows that  $\rho(a) = \alpha |W:H|$ , hence  $\rho(a) \not\equiv 0 \pmod{P}$ . Since  $\theta_i(a) \equiv 0 \pmod{P}$  this is impossible.  $\square$

## References

- [1] M. Benard, On the Schur indices of characters of the exceptional Weyl groups, *Ann. of Math.* 94(1) (1971) 89–107.
- [2] Z.I. Borevich, I.R. Shafarevich, *Number Theory*, Nauka, Moscow, 1972.
- [3] R. Gow, Groups whose characters are rational valued, *J. Algebra* 40 (1976) 280–299.
- [4] R. Gow, Real-valued characters and Schur index, *J. Algebra* 40 (1976) 258–270.
- [5] R. Gow, Real-valued and 2-rational group characters, *J. Algebra* 61 (1979) 388–413.
- [6] I.M. Isaacs, *Character Theory of Finite Groups*, Academic Press, New York, 1976.